

MUZIKA I PRIMARNI PROCESI: FRAGMENTACIJA

Miloš Zatkalik

Abstrakt: Prema brojnim psihoanalitičarima, od svih umjetnosti, muzika je najbliža nesvjesnim, predverbalnim, primarnim modusima mentalnog funkcionisanja. Kondenzacija, premještanje ili pretvaranje u suprotno, tipične su transformacije u izvođenju nesvjesnog uma. Te transformacije uključuju fragmentaciju, koja se također ističe u svim aspektima muzike: tematskom materijalu, harmonijskim progresijama, formalnoj konstrukciji i tako dalje.

Ključne riječi: fragmentacija; primarni proces; Kohut; Rose.

Prije dvije godine na simpoziju *Muzika u društvu* predstavio sam rad koji je objavljen 2018, s naslovom gotovo identičnim sadašnjem (Zatkalik, 2018). Razlika je u tome što je “kondenzacija” od prije dvije godine sada zamijenjena “fragmentacijom”. Zapravo, ovaj članak je na neki način pandan prethodnom. Kao i tada, cilj ovog članka je pružiti psihoanalitičku perspektivu određenim muzičkim strukturama i procesima; demonstrirati jedinstvenost muzike među različitim vidovima umjetnosti u njenoj bliskosti sa nesvjesnim. Posvetit će se posebna pažnja određenim dešavanjima u dvadesetom stoljeću i pokušati objasniti neviđene razine fragmentacije dostignute u muzici tog razdoblja.

Fragmentacija je u muzici sveprisutna. Utječe na sve aspekte: tematski materijal, harmonijske progresije, formalnu konstrukciju itd. Počevši od tematizma, gotovo bi se moglo nazvati sudbinom bilo koje muzičke teme da bude fragmentirana i da se u nekom budućem trenutku ponovo sastavi. Skoro da i ne postoji potreba za navođenjem primjera: dovoljno je posmatrati šta se događa s glavnim temama gotovo u bilo

kojem sonatnom obliku između sredine 18. i kraja 19. stoljeća. Tendencija ka fragmentaciji je toliko održiva, da čak i kad vjerujemo da smo identificirali najmanju i nedjeljivu česticu, pokazat će se da se i ona ipak može dalje razgrađivati:



Primjer 1.

Robert Schumann. *Erster Verlust*

Isto tako, u svakom tonalitetnom djelu, tonalitet jednom uspostavljen ima tendenciju da se fragmentira, cjelovitost harmonijskih progresija je narušena, ali zakoni tonaliteta, koji funkcioniraju kao svojevrsni muzički superego, vodit će računa da se integritet ponovo uspostavi.

Kao što sam već naveo, od ranih 1900-ih godina, fragmentacija je dosegla nivo bez presedana. Očigledno je da smo svjedočili rušenju tonalitetnog sistema. Tematski materijal se takođe dodatno raspada: veliki dio muzičkih djela izostavlja teme i zavisi od motiva ili intervala. U ekstremnim slučajevima pointilističke tekture, poput one generalno povezane s Antonom Webernom (1883–1945), samo muzičko tkivo se raspada.

Kasnije ćemo vidjeti i neke druge aspekte fragmentacije, no prije toga pokušat ću objasniti muzičku tendenciju ka fragmentaciji. Tokom posljednjih nekoliko godina sarađivao sam s beogradskim psihoanalitičarom Aleksandrom Kontićem (1958) i objavili smo nekoliko članaka u kojima detaljnije raspravljamo o odnosima muzike i nesvjesnog (Zatkalik i Kontić, 2013, 2015, 2017), prilažući brojne primjere. Bez ove saradnje, ne bi bile ostvarene niti one publikacije čiji sam ja jedini autor (Zatkalik, 2017, 2018), kao ni ovaj članak. Ovom prilikom, ponovit ću samo glavne zaključke tih istraživanja. Vezu između muzike i nesvjesnog primijetili su ne samo naučnici, već i sami kompozitori. Kada je Arnold Schönberg (1874–1951) muziku nazvao jezikom nesvjesnog (Schoenberg, 1975, 193), on možda nije bio sasvim precizan

u tom, ali je ipak shvatio suštinsku vezu između njih. Svakako, od svih umjetnosti, muzika je najbliža arhaičnim modusima mentalnog funkcionisanja: nesvjesnim, primarnim procesima. Prateći brojne psihoanalitički orijentirane stručnjake razvojne psihologije (Winnicott, 1953; Stern, 1977, 1985) ovu vezu možemo, bar dijelom, pripisati najvažnijoj ulozi koju zvuk ima u najranijoj dobi života, čak i u prenatalnom razdoblju. Muzika je, dakle, ukorijenjena u tim najranijim fazama individualnog razvoja, kada nesvjesni, predverbalni, primarni procesi čine gotovo jedini oblik mentalne aktivnosti. Nadalje, u našem prethodnom istraživanju citiranom gore, izdvojili smo izomorfizam između muzičkih struktura i procesa s jedne strane, i predstava primarnih procesa s druge strane. Više puta smo se referirali na frejdovsko¹ proučavanje snova, i pretpostavku da je takav pristup naša najbolja šansa za uvid u rad nesvjesnog uma.² Tokom rada sna stvarne percepcije su izobličene, a ova izobličenja uključuju kondenzaciju, fragmentaciju, premještanje ili davanje značenja suprotnog od onog kojeg naizgled imaju.

Ono što je presudno za našu sadašnju namjenu, analize snova otkrile su činjenicu da snevač nesvjesno često koristi fragment objekta da bi predstavio objekt u cjelini – *pars pro toto*.³ Postoji zanimljiva sličnost s muzikom, kada motivi u razvojnim dijelovima predstavljaju cijele teme.⁴

1
Sigmund Freud (1856–1939)

2
U posebnom interesu bio je san o Freudovom vjerovatno najpoznatijem pacijentu, poznatom kao Wolf Man, a koji je detaljno opisan u Freud, 1918. Naravno, Freudovo primarno istraživanje iz te oblasti ostaje *The Interpretation of Dreams* [Tumačenje snova] (Freud, 1901–1902). U razmatranju povezanosti snova i muzike, nadovezali smo se i na ranija istraživanja (Fisher, 1954; Friedman, 1960).

3
Brojni veliki kompozitori to potvrđuju opisujući proces komponovanja kao stanje blisko transu (vidi, na primjer, Abell, 1955, 25, intervju s Johannesom Brahmsom). Općenito govoreći, može se pretpostaviti da muzika pomaže u oživljavanju razvojno ranijih modusa doživljaja, fenomen koji je odgovarajuće nazvan kreativna regresija ili "regresija u službi ega" (Kris, 1952; Knafo, 2002).

4
Ovu paralelu između muzike i sna prikladno je formulisala psihoanalitičarka Julie Jaffe Nagel: "Ako verbalna analiza snova utire kraljevski put u nesvjesno [aludirajući na čuvenu Frejdovu izjavu, op. aut.], muzika pruža zvučni put do istog odredišta." (Nagel, 2008, 526)

Fragmentacija, u širem shvatanju, može se povezati sa fenomenom traumatskog cijepanja. Slijedeći Freuda, ali inkorporirajući najsavremenija istraživanja koja uključuju neuronauke, Gilbert Rose, muzički kompetentni psihoterapeut, definira traumu kao psihičko cijepanje zbog prekomjerne stimulacije, dok je ovladavanje traumom reintegracija (Rose, 1987, ix). U slučaju traume gubitka, posebno ranog gubitka, kao kad djeca izgube roditelje, posljedica nemogućnosti postepenog prolaska kroz gubitak u djetetu izaziva kontradiktoran stav: smrt je intelektualno prihvaćena, ali emocionalno poreknuta. Dolazi do rascjepa unutar ega; želja i realnost istovremeno su prisutne (Rose, 1987, 125).

Vjerujem da je *Sonata* za violinu i klavir u A-duru Césara Francka (1822–1890) primjer rascjepa na nekoliko nivoa (Primjer 2).

Allegretto ben moderato

Vn.

Pf.

A: V⁷

Vn. 6

Pf. 11

Vn. 11

Pf. 11

C#; VII⁶ V⁷ I

Primjer 2.

C. Franck. *Sonata* za violinu i klavir. I stavak. t. 1-15.

Početni dominantni akord sa intervalom velike none je na neki način podijeljen između subdominantne i dominantne

funkcije. Sljedeća funkcionalna podjela se dešava između ovog nestabilnog akorda koji ostaje u fokusu, i tonike čija je uloga nešto veća od implicirane. Prisutnost dvije modulatorne teme daje unutrašnje tonalitetno rascjepljenje. Trivijalno, s obzirom da je stav napisan u sonatnoj formi, tonalitetno rascjepljenje se nalazi između te dvije teme. Međutim, harmonijska nestabilnost doprinosi tome da se teme iznutra rascijepe čak i u reprizi, bez obzira na njihovo normativno javljanje u osnovnom tonalitetu.

Kadenca na tonici je snažno anticipirana, a zatim poništena modulacijom u Cis-dur. To je ono što podrazumijeva osjećaj gubitka; traumatsko cijepanje, dodatno pojačano registarskim promjenama. Novi tonalitet je još uvijek povezan sa materijalom prve teme, što bi se moglo protumačiti kao poricanje gubitka.

Posmatrajući u najširem smislu, cijela sonata prikazuje rascjepljenost ega. Za harmoniju se može reći da je uzeta za predstavljanje emocija i želja mašte. Nazivam harmoniju “poželjnom” jer je najprikladnija za stvaranje očekivanja, osjećaja njihovog ispunjenja ili razočarenja. Izuzetno “disciplinovanu” i uređenu vještinu ove kompozicije, prikazanu simetričnom strukturom fraza, koherentnom formom stavaka, sveukupnom višestavačnom konstrukcijom i kanonskom strukturom u posljednjem stavku, podržava intelekt (sekundarni proces mentalne aktivnosti). Kontradiktorna stanja ega su razdvojena – kao što bi rekao Otto Kernberg (1928), psihoanalitičar (prema Carsky i Ellman, 1985) – i neće se pomiriti do posljednjeg stavka.

Mogla bi se povući paralela sa karakterističnom sonatom kasnog osamnaestog stoljeća, u kojoj se sporedni tonaliteti mogu protumačiti kao jasno definisani progoniteljski objekti. Kod Francka, kao i u mnogim kasnoromantičarskim djelima, vjerovatnije je da ćemo osjetiti konstantnu anksioznost; slobodne pokretljive instinktivne nagone koji lutaju u više smjerova. Nestabilna harmonija nas održava u vječnom stanju neposrednih prijeteci događaja koji mogu uništiti naš svijet. Čudo muzike pretvara dinamiku i formu traume u ugodno iskustvo.

Trebamo još uzeti u obzir tendencije koje su se desile u posljednjih stotinu godina i više. U vezi s tim, Gilbert Rose navodi

da veliki dio moderne umjetnosti naglašava nepomirljivost koja je inherentna samoj realnosti, i tjera je da živi s logičkim suprotnostima i egzistencijalnim sukobima (Rose, 1987, 160). Čimbenici koji utječu na karakter umjetnosti nevjerovatno su kompleksni, ali bih mogao dati mali doprinos u razotkrivanju te misterije. Za ovaj doprinos dužan sam austrijsko-američkom psihoanalitičaru Heinzu Kohutu (1913–1981), jednom od glavnih predstavnika self-psihologije. Autor navodi profil *krivog čovjeka* (Kohut, 1977): to je pojedinac preokupiran izbjegavanjem Edipove krivnje kao središnjeg problema zapadne civilizacije; prilično dosljedna i integrirana ličnost, sa strukturnim elementima – što znači id, ego i superego iz Freudovog strukturnog modela uma – ulaze u sukobe, a ipak su donekle jasno ocrtni. Suprotno ovome, Kohut definira *tragičnog čovjeka*, više karakterističnog za kasnije periode 20. stoljeća, što je konceptualizacija pojedinca koji je blokiran u svom pokušaju postizanja samoostvarenja. Značajno je da *tragičnog čovjeka* progoni dezintegracijska tjeskoba. Kod takvih pojedinaca, objekt se često dijeli na “dobar” i “loš”, pozitivne i negativne emocije su mu podijeljene, zbog čega slika sebe i drugih nije integrirana. Pod pojmovima “objekt” ili “instinktivni objekt” određene psihoanalitičke škole podrazumijevaju sve ono preko čega instinkt nastoji ostvariti svoj cilj, bilo da je to osoba, stvar ili njihov dio. Takav objekt ili dio objekta može izazvati ambivalentnost, istovremeno bivajući u isto vrijeme i dobar i loš; kao naprimjer, majčina dojka koja hrani je dobra, ali gladno novorođenče koje odmah ne pronađe dojkę povezuje je s lošom dojkom. *Tragični čovjek* često doživljava djelimična poistovjećivanja s dijelovima objekata, a to čini unutarnji svijet fragmentiranim kao da je sastavljen od neintegriranih čestica, gdje je cjelinu teško razaznati, ustrajan u stanju nejasnih unutrašnjih tenzija i lebdeće depresije. Zbog ovih neprestano oscilirajućih napetosti, čovjeka modernog doba progoni strah da će se njegova psihološka struktura, što je nejasno definirano, raspasti pod pritiskom tih napetosti. To se stanje može nazvati dezintegracijskom anksioznošću. Prema Kohutu, ovo je najdublja anksioznost koju možemo iskusiti (Kohut, 1984). Ona je duboko nesvjesna i samo je umjetnost, s obzirom da je usko vezana za nesvjesno arhaično *ja*, može evocirati. Niti jedna umjetnost osim muzike nije bliža tome.

S obzirom na takve pretpostavke, možemo bolje razumjeti opća strujanja muzike koju su stvorili ljudi takve psihološke strukture ili je ona sama stvarana za njih. Već smo spomenuli slučaj krajnje fragmentacije u djelu Antona Weberna. Ne samo da ono što je fragmentirano neće biti ponovo sastavljeno: često ne postoji ništa cjelovito i integralno što bi se moglo fragmentirati. Tu ne govorimo samo o fragmentaciji u tehničkom smislu. U 20. stoljeću čak smo svjedočili rušenju sistema vrijednosti: fragmentaciji estetičkog superega. Stoga, nije čudo što je u aleatoričkoj muzici čak uloga kreatora fragmentirana.

Kada posmatramo na koji način se muzika bavi pitanjem fragmentacije, možemo izdvojiti dvije suprotne tendencije. Jedna od njih prepoznaje fragmentaciju kao stvarno i neopozivo stanje stvari. Prikazat ću to primjerom kompozicije Edgarda Varèse (1883–1965) *Octandre*.



Primjer 3.

E. Varèse. *Octandre*. t. 1-8.

Osnovna jedinica, ćelija koja se često označava u vezi sa Varèseom, nije ništa drugo nego kromatski tetrakord. Ali čak će se i ovaj tetrakord pokazati prekomjerno proširenim, te se stoga dijeli na dva međusobno povezana trikorada, što je najbolje predstavljeno Forteovim setovima 012 i 013. Dakle, veći dio prvog stavka odvija se u stalnoj preraspodjeli ovih trikorada u vremenu i prostoru.⁵ To uključuje njihove kolizije, prožimanja, dok je rijetko nagoviještena njihova integracija u šire konfiguracije. Pa čak ni to nije dovoljno.

5

Detaljna analiza se nalazi u Moura, 2004.

Drugi stavak dalje razbija navedene trikorde, i samo kromatski par ispunjava početni dio stavka. Istina je da postoji nešto slično reprizi u prvom stavku, ali mogli bismo to nazvati prevarom (izvinjavam se zbog ovog izraza, nisam mogao naći bolji način da to opišem). Pribjeći kliše: *too little, too late*, i – proširiti kliše – nekako je previše izvan konteksta da može služiti formalnoj funkciji reprize. Takve reprize prije poimamo kao pojavu potisnutih čestica nesvjesnog koje su iznenada isplivale na površinu.

The image displays two pages of musical notation for a symphony orchestra. The first page shows measures 10-15, and the second page shows measures 16-19. The notation includes staves for Flute (Pte Fl.), Horn (Hb.), Clarinet (Cl. Mi.), Bassoon (Bsn.), Cor, Trumpet (Tpt.), Trombone (Trbn.), and C. Bass (C. base). The music is in 2/4 time and features various dynamics and articulations. The first page shows measures 10-15, and the second page shows measures 16-19. The notation includes staves for Flute, Horn, Clarinet, Bassoon, Cor, Trumpet, Trombone, and C. Bass. The music is in 2/4 time and features various dynamics and articulations.

Primjer 4.

E. Varèse. *Octandre*. II stav. t. 10-19.

Druga tendencija prkosi fragmentaciji, nastoji ponuditi model svijeta koji bi izgledao povezan i koherentan. Nikada prije nismo vidjeli takvo širenje kompozicijskih sistema ili algoritama za

generiranje muzike. Ipak, kako mnogi od ovih sistema imaju malu perceptivnu vrijednost, oni u konačnici mogu dokazati beskorisnost odupiranja fragmentaciji.

Poučno je ispitati samu muzičku analizu, njene interese, njen diskurs u kojem obiluju pojmovi kao što su cjelovitost, povezanost, organska koherencija (biološke metafore su posebno ra-prostranjene), poštovati “jedinstvo u raznolikosti” kao vrhovni estetski zakon. Već 1970-ih, kada je Allen Forte objavljivao svoju knjigu *The Structure of Atonal Music*, još uvijek je imao za cilj otkriti principe kontinuiteta i koherentnosti. Muzički analitičari su poznati po svojoj sposobnosti za otkrivanjem koherentnosti. U prethodno opisanom *Octandreu*, entuzijastični analitičar može osmisliti određene konfiguracije koje proizlaze iz integracije gore spomenutih ćelija i možda naći zanimljiv način da ih prezentira kao autentične hijerarhijske strukture (kao na primjer u Ilišević, 2014). Međutim, u novije vrijeme, muzička analiza se počela naginjati ka suprotnom polu, posvećujući veću pažnju dezintegrirajućim tendencijama. Prema tome, kada je Robert Morgan napisao članak *The Concept of Unity and Music Analysis* (Morgan, 2003), Jonathan Kramer uspijeva propisno odgovoriti svojim radom *The Concept of Disunity and Music Analysis* (Kramer, 2004). Ako je 1987. Nicholas Cook u svom vodiču *A Guide to Musical Analysis* (1987) predstavio analitičke tendencije koje su imale za cilj otkrivanje kohezije, 2006. godine pisao je o principima suprotnosti, kolaža i montaže. Neki savremeni teoretičari ističu da je dosljedna hijerarhijska uniformiranost mit, čak i u muzici u kojoj konvencionalna mudrost najviše teži ka jasnoj i strogoj organizaciji – muzici 18. stoljeća. Robert Gjerdingen, na primjer, otkriva u Mozartovoj muzici ono što bi bila čista hereza za šenkerijance: sukcesija više malih struktura koje nemaju nikakvu jaču vezu osim one koja proizlazi iz generalnog raspoloženja (Gjerdingen, 2007, 425-426).

Na jedno od glavnih pitanja – zašto je fragmentacija “prirod-nija” u muzici nego u bilo kojem drugom obliku umjetnosti – vjerujem da je odgovoreno ranije u ovom radu. Da ponovim: muzička umjetnost nadmašuje ostale umjetnosti u svom korištenju nesvjesnih primarnih procesa, pa shodno tome, sile fragmentacije djeluju snažnije u muzici nego drugdje. Ipak, na kraju ovog rada, prepustit ću se prikazivanju nekoliko primje-

ra iz drugih umjetnosti. Čuvena *Guernica* Pabla Picassa (1881–1973) je primjer kako se fragmentacija koristi za prizivanje osjećaja strahote koji je vladao u Španskom građanskom ratu.



Primjer 5.

P. Picasso. *Guernica* (Picasso, 1937)

Inače, naredni primjer Salvadora Dalíja (1904–1989) odnosi se također na iste historijske okolnosti:



Primjer 6.

S. Dalí. *Soft Construction with Boiled Beans. Premonition of Civil War* (Dalí, 1936)

Čini se da nije potrebno dalje komentarisati.

Konačno, fragmentacija je moguća i u književnosti, iako je verbalna sfera *par excellence* domena sekundarnih procesa. To nigdje nije predstavljeno sa više jasnoće kao u dva romana Jamesa Joycea (1882–1941), *Uliks* i *Fineganovo bdijenje*. Dakle, u romanu *Uliks*, u epizodi *Sirene* – koja se uglavnom smatra najmuzikalnijom od svih – nalazimo sljedeće:

“ – Ja mislim da sam ja tada spasao situaciju, Bene.

– Jesi – potvrdi Ben Dolard. – Sećam se i onih tesnih pantalona. Bila je to sjajna ideja, Bobe. Otac Kauli pocrvene do sjajnih purpurnih ušiju. Spasao je situa. Tesne panta. Sjajna ide.” (Džojls, 2003, 287)

Zaista je potreban autor ništa manje važniji od Joycea da proizvede verbalnu repliku muzičke teme koja je prvo izrečena, a zatim fragmentirana. Gotovo bizarni efekti prethodna tri primjera, nasuprot fragmentaciji koja se bez napora postiže muzikom, uvjerljiv su dokaz jedinstvenosti muzike u njenoj sposobnosti da djeluje na najdublja skrovišta naše psihe.

Reference

- Abell, A., 1955. *Talks with Great Composers*. New York: Citadel Press.
- Carsky, M. i Ellman, S., 1985. Otto Kernberg: Psychoanalysis and Object Relations Theory: The Beginnings of an Integrative Approach. U: J. Reppen, ur. *Beyond Freud: A Study of Modern Psychoanalytic Theories*. [online] Dostupno na: <https://www.freepsychotherapybooks.org/ebook/otto-kernbergpsychoanalysis-and-object-relations-theory-the-beginnings-of-an-integrative-approach/> [Posjećeno: 5. juni 2020].
- Cook, N., 1987. *A Guide to Musical Analysis*. London, Melbourne: J. M. Dent and Sons.
- Cook, N., 2006. Uncanny Moments: Juxtaposition and Collage Principle in Music. U: B. Almén i E. Pearsall, ur. *Approaches to Meaning in Music*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 107-134.

- Dalí, S., 1936. *Soft Construction with Boiled Beans. Premonition of Civil War*. [slika] Dostupno na: <https://en.opisanie-kartin.com/description-of-the-painting-by-salvador-dali-a-soft-composition-with-boiled-beans-a-premonition-of-civil-war/> [Posjećeno: 6. juni 2020].
- Džojš, Dž., 2003. *Uliks*. Prijevod s engleskog Z. Paunović. Beograd: Geopoetika.
- Gjerdingen, R., 2007. *Music in the Gallant Style*. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Fisher, Ch., 1954. Dreams and Perception – the Role of Pre-conscious and Primary Modes of Perception in Dream Formation. *Journal of American Psychoanalytic Association*, 2, 389-444.
- Freud, S., 1901–1902. *The Interpretation of Dreams*. Reprint 1953. Standard Edition. Vol. IV-V. Prijevod s njemačkog J. Strachey. London: Hogarth Press.
- Freud, S., 1918. *From the History of an Infantile Neurosis*. Reprint 1955. U: J. Strachey and A. Freud, ur. Standard Edition. Vol. XVII. London: Hogarth Press.
- Friedman, S. M., 1960. One Aspect of the Structure of Music – A Study of Regressive Transformations of Musical Themes. *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association*, 8, 427-449.
- Илишевић, Т., 2014. *Циљно оријентисани процеси у раду са звучним масама: Композиције Едгара Вареза и Витолда Лутославског*. Специјалистички рад. Универзитет уметности у Београду.
- Knafo, D., 2002. Revisiting Ernst Kris's Concept of Regression in the Service of the Ego in Art. *Psychoanalytic Psychology*, 19(1), 24-49.
- Kohut, H., 1977. *The restoration of the self*. New York: International Universities Press.
- Kohut, H., 1984. *How does analysis cure?* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Kramer, J., 2004. The Concept of Disunity and Musical Analysis. *Music Analysis*, 23(2-3), 361-372.
- Kris, E., 1952. *Psychoanalytic Explorations in Art*. New York: International Universities Press.
- Morgan, R., 2003. The Concept of Unity and Musical Analysis. *Music Analysis*, 22(1/2), 7-50.
- Moura, E., 2004. Interaction between the Generative Cell and

- Symmetrical Operations in Varèse's "Octandre". *Contemporary Music Review*, 23(1), 17-44.
- Nagel, J. J., 2008. Psychoanalytic Perspectives on Music: An Intersection on the Oral and Aural Road. *Psychoanalytic Quarterly*, 77(2), 507-529.
- Picasso, P., 1937. *Guernica*. [slika] Dostupno na: <https://pl.pinterest.com/pin/382102349627658732/visualsearch/?cropSource=6&h=236&w=530&x=16&y=10> [Posjećeno: 6. juni 2020].
- Rose, G., 1987. *Trauma and Mastery in Life and Art*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Schoenberg, A., 1975. *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*. L. Stein, ur. Berkeley, Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Stern, D., 1977. *The First Relationship: Infant and Mother*. London: Harvard University Press.
- Stern, D., 1985. *The Interpersonal World of the Infant: A View from Psychoanalysis and Development*. New York: Basic Books.
- Winnicott, D. W., 1953. Transitional object and transitional phenomena. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 34, 89-97.
- Zatkalik, M., 2017. Psychoanalytic Reflections on Modulation. [pdf] *9th European Music Analysis Conference (EURO-MAC)*. Strasbourg, 28. juni–1. juli 2017. Dostupno na: <http://euromac2017.unistra.fr/en/conference/psychoanalytic-reflections-on-modulation-2/> [Posjećeno: 29. maj 2019].
- Zatkalik, M., 2018. Music as Ruled by Primary Processes: Condensation. U: A. Bosnić i N. Hukić, ur. *Collection of papers of the 10th International Symposium "Music in society"*. Sarajevo: Muzikološko društvo FBiH, Muzička akademija Univerziteta u Sarajevu. 25-37.
- Zatkalik, M. i Kontić, A., 2013. Is There a Wolf Lurking Behind These Notes: The Unconscious Code of Music. U: M. Zatkalik, D. Collins i M. Medić, ur. *Histories and Narratives of Music Analysis*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. 628-644.
- Zatkalik, M. i Kontić, A., 2015. Psychoanalysis and Music: Discourse about the Ineffable. *Muzikologija*, 19, 127-146.
- Zatkalik, M. i Kontić, A., 2017. Regression in Music or How to Communicate the Ineffable. *Principle of Music Composing*, XVII, 25-32.

MUSIC AS RULED BY PRIMARY PROCESSES: FRAGMENTATION

Miloš Zatkalik

Abstract: According to a number of psychoanalysts, music is the closest of all the arts to the unconscious, preverbal primary modes of mental functions. Condensation, displacement, or becoming opposite are typical transformations performed by the unconscious mind. These transformations include fragmentation, which also features prominently in all aspects of music: thematic material, harmonic progressions, formal constructions, and so on.

Keywords: fragmentation; primary process; Kohut; Rose.

Two years ago, at the conference *Music in Society*, I presented a paper – published in 2018 – with a title almost identical to the present one (Zatkalik, 2018). The difference is that the “condensation” from two years ago has now been replaced with “fragmentation”. Indeed, the present paper is, in a way, a counterpart to the previous one. It aims to provide a psychoanalytical perspective to specific musical structures and processes; to demonstrate the uniqueness of music among various forms of art in its closeness to the unconscious. Special attention will be dedicated to certain developments in the twentieth century, and it will try to account for the unprecedented levels of fragmentation reached in the music of that period.

Fragmentation is ubiquitous in music. It affects all aspects: thematic material, harmonic progressions, formal construction etc. Beginning with thematism, one might almost call it the destiny of any musical theme to be fragmented, and at some future point, reassembled. There is hardly a need to adduce examples: it will suffice to observe what happens with primary themes in virtually any Sonata Allegro movement between

the mid-eighteenth and late nineteenth century. The tendency to fragmentation is so persistent that even when we believe we have identified the smallest and indivisible particle, it will transpire that it can be broken down even further.



Figure 1.
Robert Schumann. *Erster Verlust*

Likewise, in every tonal piece, the tonality, once established, tends to be fragmented, and the integrity of harmonic progressions fractured. However, the laws of tonality, functioning as a kind of musical superego, will see to it that the integrity is ultimately restored.

As I have indicated, fragmentation has reached extreme heights since the early 1900s. Most obviously, we have witnessed the disintegration of the tonal system. Thematic material has also further decomposed: a great deal of music has dispensed with themes and hinges instead on motives or intervals. In extreme cases of pointillistic texture, such as generally associated with Anton Webern (1883–1945), the very fabric of music disintegrates.

Later, we will see some other aspects of fragmentation, but I will first try to take a step toward explaining music's predilection for fragmentation. Over the last several years, I have collaborated with the Belgrade psychoanalyst Aleksandar Kontić (1958), and we have published several articles which discussed the relationships between music and the unconscious at greater length (Zatkalik and Kontić, 2013, 2015, 2017), adducing several examples. Without this collaboration, even those publications I was the sole author of (Zatkalik, 2017, 2018), as well as the present paper, would not have materialized. On this occasion, I will reiterate only the main points. The connection between music and the unconscious has been noted not only by scholars but by composers as well. When Arnold Schönberg (1874–1951) called music the language of the unconscious (Schoenberg, 1975, 193), he may not have been

entirely accurate, but he had grasped the fundamental link between the two. Arguably, music is the closest of the arts to the archaic modes of mental functioning: the unconscious primary processes. Following a number of psychoanalytically oriented developmental psychologists (Winnicott, 1953; Stern, 1977, 1985), we can attribute this link, at least in part, to the paramount role that sound plays in our earliest infancy, even in the prenatal period. Music is, therefore, rooted in these earliest stages of individual development, when unconscious, preverbal primary processes constitute the only form of mentation. Furthermore, in our previous research quoted above, we have pointed out isomorphism between musical structures and processes on the one hand and representations of primary processes on the other. We have repeatedly referred to the Freudian¹ approach to dreams, and the assumption that the study of dreams is our best chance to obtain a glimpse of the workings of the unconscious mind.² Real-life percepts are distorted by dreamwork, and these distortions include condensation, fragmentation, displacement, or giving a meaning opposite to the one it ostensibly has.

Crucially for our present purpose, analyses of dreams have disclosed that the dreamer's unconscious often uses a fragment of an object to represent the object as a whole – *pars pro toto*.³ There is a glaring similarity in music when motifs in developing sections represent entire themes.⁴

1
Sigmund Freud (1856–1939)

2
Of special interest was the dream of Freud's probably most famous patient, known as Wolf Man, described in great detail in Freud, 1918. Naturally, Freud's *Interpretation of Dreams* (Freud, 1901–1902) remains a seminal study in that field. In our considerations of the links between dreams and music, we have also built upon the earlier research (Fisher, 1954; Friedman, 1960).

3
A number of great composers corroborate this by describing the process of composing as close to a dream-like state (see, for instance, Abell, 1955, 25 for an interview with Johannes Brahms). Generally speaking, it can be surmised that music helps revive the developmentally earlier modes of experience, the phenomenon aptly named creative regression or "regression in the service of the ego" (Kris, 1952; Knafo, 2002).

4
This dream/music parallel was aptly formulated by the psychoanalyst Julie Jaffe Nagel: "If the verbal analysis of dreams paves a royal road to the unconscious [alluding to the famous Freud's statement, Author's note], music provides an aural road to the same destination." (Nagel, 2008, 526)

Fragmentation, somewhat broadly conceived, can be related to the phenomenon of traumatic splitting. Following Freud, but incorporating more up-to-date research including neurosciences, a musically competent psychotherapist named Gilbert Rose has defined trauma as a psychic splitting due to overstimulation, whereas mastery of the trauma is reintegration (Rose, 1987, ix). In trauma cases involving loss, particularly early losses such as children losing a parent, the child is left with a contradictory attitude due to the inability to gradually work through it: the death is intellectually accepted but emotionally denied. A split within the ego occurs where wishes and reality exist side by side (Rose, 1987, 125).

I believe that *Sonata* for Violin and Piano in A major by César Franck (1822–1890) exemplifies such splits at several levels (Figure 2).

Allegretto ben moderato

The musical score is for the first movement of César Franck's *Sonata* for Violin and Piano in A major, measures 1-15. The tempo is marked 'Allegretto ben moderato'. The key signature is A major (three sharps). The time signature is 3/4. The score is written for Violin (Vn.) and Piano (Pf.). The violin part is marked 'molto dolce' and features a simple, melodic line. The piano part is marked 'pp' (pianissimo) and features a complex, arpeggiated accompaniment. The score includes dynamic markings such as 'pp' and 'sempre dolce'. Harmonic annotations are present, including 'A: V^9', 'I^b - 5', 'VII_V - 16', 'C#; VII_V - 16', and 'V^7'. The score is divided into three systems, with measures 1-5, 6-10, and 11-15. The first system shows the initial entry of the piano accompaniment. The second system shows the continuation of the piano accompaniment with some harmonic changes. The third system shows the continuation of the piano accompaniment with some harmonic changes.

Figure 2.
 C. Franck. *Sonata* for Violin and Piano. I movement. b. 1-15.

The initial dominant chord with its major ninth is, in a way, split between the subdominant and dominant functions. A further functional split is between the unstable chord that remains in focus, and the tonic, which more than implied. There are two themes, both modulatory, hence internally tonally split. Trivially, the movement being in sonata form, there is a tonal split between the two themes. However, harmonic instability renders them internally separate even in their recapitulation, notwithstanding their normative appearance in the home key.

The tonic cadence is strongly anticipated and then denied by the modulation in C-sharp major. This traumatic splitting, enhanced by the registral shift, entails a sense of loss. The new key is still tied to the material of the first theme, which can be interpreted as a denial of loss.

From the broadest perspective, the entire sonata exemplifies an ego split. Harmony may be used to represent emotion and wishful imagination. I call harmony “wishful” because it is most suitable for creating expectations about their sense of fulfillment or frustration. The highly “disciplined” and ordered craft of this composition, exemplified by the symmetrical phrase structure, the coherent form of movements, the overall multi-movement construction, and canonic structure in the last movement, stands for intellect (the secondary process of mentation). Contradictory ego states are separated – as psychoanalyst Otto Kernberg (1928) would say (cited in Carsky and Ellman, 1985) – not to be reconciled until the last movement.

A parallel may be drawn with a typical late eighteen-century sonata in which subsidiary keys were experienced as definite persecutory objects. In Franck, and for that matter, many of the late romantic works, we are more likely to experience constant anxiety; freely mobile instinctual drives wandering in multiple directions. The unstable harmony keeps us in a perpetual state of imminent threatening events that may shatter our world. The miracle of music transmutes the dynamics and the form of trauma into a pleasurable experience.

We need yet to account for the tendencies of the last hundred plus years. Concerning these, Gilbert Rose suggests that a great

deal of modern art highlights the irreconcilability inherent in reality, and forces one to live with logical opposites and existential conflicts (Rose, 2004, 160). Factors that influence the character of art are incredibly complex, and I can offer only a tiny contribution to the unravelling of that mystery. To that end, I am heavily indebted to the Austrian-American psychoanalyst Heinz Kohut (1913–1981), one of the foremost exponents of self-psychology. He outlined the profile of the *Guilty Man* (Kohut, 1977): the individual preoccupied with the avoidance of Oedipal guilt as the central problem of Western civilization; the relatively coherent and integrated personality, with structural elements – meaning the id, ego and superego from the Freudian structural model of the mind – entering conflicts, yet staying relatively clearly outlined. Yet, Kohut defines the *Tragic Man*, more typical of the later portions of the 20th century, as the conceptualization of the individual when blocked in his attempt to achieve self-realization.

Most significantly, the *Tragic Man* is haunted by disintegration anxiety. With such individuals, the object is often split into “good” and “bad”, positive and negative emotions are compartmentalized, and the image of self and others stay disintegrated. Some psychoanalytic schools define “object” or “instinctual object” as anything through which an instinct seeks to attain its aim, be it a person, a thing, or a portion thereof. Such an object, or part-object, may evoke ambivalence, being as it is, both good and bad; for example, a mother’s breast that feeds immediately is good, but one that is absent in the face of a hungry infant is a bad breast. The *Tragic Man* often experiences partial identifications with part-objects. This fragments the inner world, as though it is composed out of unintegrated particles where the whole is difficult to discern, and persists in a state of vague internal tensions and floating depression. Due to these incessantly oscillating tensions, the modern man is haunted by a fear that his vaguely defined psychological structure will break under the pressure. This state can be referred to as disintegration anxiety. According to Kohut, this is the deepest anxiety we can experience (Kohut, 1984). It is deeply unconscious and can only be evoked by an art closely tied to the unconscious archaic self. No art is closer to that than music.

Given such premises, we can better understand the general drift of the music created by and for people of such psychological structure. We have already mentioned an instance of ultimate fragmentation in Anton Webern. It is not only that what is fragmented will not be put together again: often there is nothing whole or integral to be fragmented in the first place. This fragmentation goes beyond the technical sense. In the twentieth century, we have even witnessed the breakdown of the system of values: the fragmentation of the aesthetic superego. It is no wonder, then, that in aleatory music, even the agency of the creator is fragmented.

When we observe how music deals with fragmentation, we can single out two antithetical tendencies. One is to recognize fragmentation as the actual and irrevocable state of affairs. I will illustrate this with the example of Edgard Varèse's (1883–1965) *Octandre*.



Figure 3.
 E. Varèse. *Octandre*. b. 1-8.

The basic unit, the cell as frequently termed in connection with Varèse, is no more than a chromatic tetrachord. But even this tetrachord will prove to be overly extensive, so it splits into two interlocking trichords, best represented as Forte sets 012 and 013. Thus, the greater portion of the first movement unfolds into a perpetual redistribution of these trichords in time and space.⁵ This includes their collisions and interpenetrations,

5
 A detailed analysis is found in Moura, 2004.

but their integration into broader configurations is hardly ever hinted towards. And even that is not sufficient and continues.

The second movement further breaks down these trichords, and a mere chromatic dyad fills the initial portion of the movement. It is true that there is something in the nature of a reprise in the first movement, but we would call it a sham (begging forgiveness for this expression; I could not find a better way to describe it). To resort to a cliché: it is too little, too late and somehow too far out of context to be able to serve the formal function of a reprise. Such reprises feel rather like the emergence of repressed particles of the unconscious, brought suddenly to the surface.

The image displays two staves of musical notation for E. Varèse's *Octandre*, II movement, measures 10-19. The top staff (measures 10-16) shows the initial portion of the movement, featuring a variety of instruments including Piccolo Flute (Pte Fl.), Horn (Hb.), Clarinet in Middle C (Cl. Mi.), Bassoon (Bsn.), Cor, Trumpet (Tpt.), Trombone (Trbn.), and Cello/Double Bass (C. base). The notation includes various dynamics such as *p*, *mp*, and *sf*, and includes performance instructions like *rit. delib.*, *pizz.*, and *arco*. The bottom staff (measures 16-19) continues the piece, featuring similar instrumentation and dynamics, with additional instructions like *sfz* and *mp*.

Figure 4.
 E. Varèse. *Octandre*. II movement. b. 10-19.

The other tendency defies fragmentation and seeks to offer a model of the world that would appear connected and coherent. Never before have we seen such proliferation of compositional systems or algorithms for generating music. Yet, as many of these systems have little perceptual value, they may ultimately prove the futility of resisting fragmentation.

It is instructive to examine music analysis itself, its interests, its discourse in which abound notions such as integrity, connectedness, organic coherence (biological metaphors are particularly widespread), the venerated “unity in diversity” as the supreme aesthetical law. As late as the 1970s, when Allen Forte was publishing *The Structure of Atonal Music*, he still aimed to discover the principles of continuity and coherence. Music analysts are notorious for their ability to discover coherence. In the previously discussed *Octandre*, an enthusiastic analyst may eventually come up with certain configurations arising from the integration of the aforementioned cells, and possibly find an elegant way to present them as an authentic hierarchical structure (as, for instance, in Ilišević, 2014). More recently, however, music analysis has begun to lean towards the opposite pole, to pay more attention to disintegrating tendencies. Thus, when Robert Morgan wrote an article titled *The Concept of Unity and Music Analysis* (Morgan, 2003), Jonathan Kramer was able to duly respond with *The Concept of Disunity and Music Analysis* (Kramer, 2004). Nicholas Cook presented analytical tendencies in *A Guide to Musical Analysis* (1987) that aimed at discovering cohesion, and in 2006 he wrote about juxtaposition, collage, and montage principles. Some recent theorists point out that consistent hierarchical uniformity is a myth even in music styles where conventional wisdom is most eager to search for clear and strict organization: specifically, music of the 18th century. Robert Gjerdingen, for instance, finds in Mozart what would be sheer heresy for Shenkerians: a succession of many small structures that lack any strong connection other than that derived from the general mood (Gjerdingen, 2007, 425-426).

One of the chief questions – why does fragmentation come more “naturally” in music than to any other form of art – was answered, I believe, early on in this paper. To reiterate: music

surpasses other arts in its share of unconscious primary processes, and accordingly, the forces of fragmentation operate more strongly in music than elsewhere. However, to end this paper, I will indulge myself with a few examples from other arts. The famous *Guernica* by Pablo Picasso (1881–1973) offers an example of how fragmentation is used to invoke the sense of the horrors perpetrated in the Spanish civil war.



Figure 5.

P. Picasso. *Guernica* (Picasso, 1937)

Incidentally, the next example by Salvador Dalí (1904–1989) also relates to the same historical circumstances:



Figure 6.

S. Dalí. *Soft Construction with Boiled Beans. Premonition of Civil War* (Dalí, 1936)

No further comments seem to be necessary.

Finally, fragmentation is possible even in literary art, although the verbal sphere is *par excellence* in the domain of secondary processes. Nowhere is it presented with more clarity than in two novels by James Joyce (1882–1941), *Ulysses* and *Finnegans Wake*. Thus, in *Ulysses*, in the *Sirens* episode – generally considered as the most musical of all – we find the following:

“– I saved the situation, Ben, I think.

– You did, averred Ben Dollard. I remember those tight trousers too. That was a brilliant idea, Bob.

Father Cowley blushed to his brilliant purply lobes. He saved the situa. Tight trou. Brilliant ide.” (Joyce, 1986, 480–485)⁶

It takes an author no less formidable than Joyce to produce a verbal replica of a musical theme first stated, then fragmented. The almost bizarre effects of the previous three examples, as opposed to the effortless fragmentation achieved by music, is a convincing proof of the uniqueness of music in its ability to engage with the innermost recesses of our psyche.

6

As is usual in literature on Joyce, passages from *Ulysses* are referred to by page and line numbers in the standard Gabler edition.

References

- Abell, A., 1955. *Talks with Great Composers*. New York: Citadel Press.
- Carsky, M. and Ellman, S., 1985. Otto Kernberg: Psychoanalysis and Object Relations Theory: The Beginnings of an Integrative Approach. In: J. Reppen, ed. *Beyond Freud: A Study of Modern Psychoanalytic Theories*. [online] Available at: <https://www.freepsychotherapybooks.org/ebook/otto-kernbergpsychoanalysis-and-object-relations-theory-the-beginnings-of-an-integrative-approach/> [Accessed: 5 June 2020].
- Cook, N., 1987. *A Guide to Musical Analysis*. London, Melbourne: J. M. Dent and Sons.
- Cook, N., 2006. Uncanny Moments: Juxtaposition and Collage Principle in Music. In: B. Almén and E. Pearsall, eds. *Approaches to Meaning in Music*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 107-134.
- Dalí, S., 1936. *Soft Construction with Boiled Beans. Premonition of Civil War*. [painting] Available at: <https://en.opisanie-kartin.com/description-of-the-painting-by-salvador-dali-a-soft-composition-with-boiled-beans-a-premonition-of-civil-war/> [Accessed: 6 June 2020].
- Gjerdingen, R., 2007. *Music in the Gallant Style*. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Fisher, Ch., 1954. Dreams and Perception – the Role of Pre-conscious and Primary Modes of Perception in Dream Formation. *Journal of American Psychoanalytic Association*, 2, 389-444.
- Freud, S., 1901–1902. *The Interpretation of Dreams*. Reprint 1953. Standard Edition. Vol. IV-V. Translated from German by J. Strachey. London: Hogarth Press.
- Freud, S., 1918. *From the History of an Infantile Neurosis*. Reprint 1955. In: J. Strachey and A.
- Freud, eds. Standard Edition. Vol. XVII. London: Hogarth Press.
- Friedman, S. M., 1960. One Aspect of the Structure of Music – A Study of Regressive Transformations of Musical Themes. *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association*, 8, 427-449.

- Ilišević, T., 2014. *Ciljno orijentisani procesi u radu sa zvučnim masama: kompozicije Edgara Vareza i Vitolda Lutoslavskog*. [cyr.] Specialization paper. Univerzitet umetnosti u Beogradu.
- Joyce, J., 1986. *Ulysses*. W. Gabler, ed. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.
- Knafo, D., 2002. Revisiting Ernst Kris's Concept of Regression in the Service of the Ego in Art. *Psychoanalytic Psychology*, 19(1), 24-49.
- Kohut, H., 1977. *The restoration of the self*. New York: International Universities Press.
- Kohut, H., 1984. *How does analysis cure?* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Kramer, J., 2004. The Concept of Disunity and Musical Analysis. *Music Analysis*, 23(2-3), 361-372.
- Kris, E., 1952. *Psychoanalytic Explorations in Art*. New York: International Universities Press.
- Morgan, R., 2003. The Concept of Unity and Musical Analysis. *Music Analysis*, 22(1/2), 7-50.
- Moura, E., 2004. Interaction between the Generative Cell and Symmetrical Operations in Varèse's "Octandre". *Contemporary Music Review*, 23(1), 17-44.
- Nagel, J. J., 2008. Psychoanalytic Perspectives on Music: An Intersection on the Oral and Aural Road. *Psychoanalytic Quarterly*, 77(2), 507-529.
- Picasso, P., 1937. *Guernica*. [painting] Available at: <https://pl.pinterest.com/pin/382102349627658732/visualsearch/?cropSource=6&h=236&w=530&x=16&y=10> [Accessed: 6 June 2020].
- Rose, G., 1987. *Trauma and Mastery in Life and Art*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Schoenberg, A., 1975. *Style and Idea: Selected Writings of Arnold Schoenberg*. L. Stein, ed. Berkeley, Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Stern, D., 1977. *The First Relationship: Infant and Mother*. London: Harvard University Press.
- Stern, D., 1985. *The Interpersonal World of the Infant: A View from Psychoanalysis and Development*. New York: Basic Books.

- Winnicott, D. W., 1953. Transitional object and transitional phenomena. *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 34, 89-97.
- Zatkalik, M., 2017. Psychoanalytic Reflections on Modulation. [pdf] 9th *European Music Analysis Conference (EU-ROMAC)*. Strasbourg, 28 June–1 July 2017. Available at: <http://euromac2017.unistra.fr/en/conference/psychoanalytic-reflections-on-modulation-2/> [Accessed: 29 May 2019].
- Zatkalik, M., 2018. Music as Ruled by Primary Processes: Condensation. In: A. Bosnić and N. Hukić, eds. *Collection of papers of the 10th International Symposium “Music in society”*. Sarajevo: Muzikološko društvo FBiH, Muzička akademija Univerziteta u Sarajevu. 25-37.
- Zatkalik, M. and Kontić, A., 2013. Is There a Wolf Lurking Behind These Notes: The Unconscious Code of Music. In: M. Zatkalik, D. Collins and M. Medić, eds. *Histories and Narratives of Music Analysis*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. 628-644.
- Zatkalik, M. and Kontić, A., 2015. Psychoanalysis and Music: Discourse about the Ineffable. *Muzikologija*, 19, 127-146.
- Zatkalik, M. and Kontić, A., 2017. Regression in Music or How to Communicate the Ineffable. *Principle of Music Composing*, XVII, 25-32.